In 2004, Floridians experienced one of the worst hurricane seasons on record. Four storms hit Florida in the months of August and September. On August 13, 2004 Hurricane Charley passed directly over the Dry Tortugas with maximum winds near 95 kts. The reefs and islands of the Dry Tortugas National Park were subjected to tropical storm and/or hurricane force winds and waves for nearly 10 hours. The CREMP team sampled the Dry Tortugas sites approximately 54 days post hurricane Charley.

Shallow water sites sustained the greatest storm damage at the Dry Tortugas. Broken Acroporid colonies, detached octocorals, sponges, algae, and clean bare substrate were observed at shallow reef sites near Garden Key.

On deeper reefs in the Dry Tortugas, the most obvious sign of Hurricane Charley was fine sediment, which covered many corals and sponges. Occasionally a large toppled coral colony was observed lying in the sediment between the spurs or on top of adjacent colonies. Colonies that were toppled were often bleached as well. Many sponges appeared to have been impacted by the storm. One observer counted 18 tube sponges that had presumably been broken off by the storm and deposited in the sand in the between two spurs. Scattered octocorals and fleshy algae collected in the grooves between spurs. CREMP sites in other regions of the Florida Keys reportedly incurred only minor damage.
Each site is permanently marked with stainless steel stakes epoxied in the bottom. The relocation process is the true search for “a needle in the haystack”.

The Set-up Team carries 2 sets of poles, 6 chains, and 6 fiberglass tapes from the support vessel to the site. They are responsible for locating the site, establishing the station transects, moving the transects along the site with the sampling team, and breaking down the setup.

A pair of observers records stony coral species presence, coral disease, and bleaching within a 2m x 22m area at each station.

Percent cover of live coral, selected sessile benthic biota, and substrate is determined annually from video transects filmed at each station. Abutting frames with minimal overlap are extracted from a mosaic and analyzed using a custom software application called Point Count ‘99 for coral reefs.

Three clionid sponge species (Cliona delitrix, C. lampa, and C. caribbaea) are known to be aggressive coral bio-eroders. The sponge survey area is designated by three one-meter wide belt transects. The location, species, and size of each sponge colony is recorded, as well as the species of stony coral affected by the clionid colony.

The Disease Coral Survey (DCS) was designed to determine whether or not coral diseases significantly influence the survival of stony coral in the Florida Keys. This study quantifies the abundance and distribution of diseases/conditions on coral species. Colonies are assessed by annually photographing individual coral colonies at the nine Value-Added Sites in the Florida Keys CREMP.
Between 2003 and 2004, the CREMP documented a decrease in the mean number of species per station at Middle and Lower Keys stations. In the Middle Keys, mean species richness declined from 15.2 in 2003 to 14.5 in 2004. A similar decrease was observed in the Lower Keys where species richness declined from 15.1 in 2003 to 14.4 in 2004. At Upper Keys stations, species richness remained essentially unchanged. The greatest decrease in species richness was seen at the Dry Tortugas where the mean number of species per station decreased from 19.8 in 2003 to 17.7 in 2004 (Fig. 3).

Sanctuary-wide from 1996 to 2004, for a total of 105 stations, the number of stony coral species declined at 83 (79%) stations, increased at 15 (14%) stations, and remained unchanged at 7 (6%) stations. A decline in the number of stony coral species was recorded in all habitat types except hardbottoms. The offshore deep and patch reef stations had the greatest numbers of stony coral taxa with a mean of 16 and 15 species, respectively. Hardbottom stations had the fewest number of stony coral species, averaging 11 species per station (Fig 2).

Figure 1. Coral Reef Evaluation and Monitoring Project site locations and region boundaries.

Station Species Inventory

Figure 2. Mean number of stony coral species per year by habitat type.

Figure 3. Mean number of stony coral species per year by region.
Between 1996 and 2004, stony coral cover declined from 11.9% to 6.6% Sanctuary-wide (Fig. 4). The decline in mean percent stony coral cover from 1997 to 1998 and from 1998 to 1999 was significant with a p-value of 0.03 or less for the Wilcoxon rank-sum test. Between 1997 and 1998, stony coral cover declined from 11.4% to 9.6%. The downward trend continued between 1998 and 1999 when stony coral cover declined from 9.6% to 7.4%. The changes observed from 1996 to 1997, and 1999 to 2003 were determined to be statistically insignificant. Sanctuary-wide, stony coral cover in 2004 was 6.6%.

While patch reef sites in all regions displayed a decrease in stony coral cover, the Lower Keys patch reef sites showed the largest continual decrease in stony coral cover. Between 1996 and 2004, mean percent stony coral cover at Lower Keys patch reef sites decreased from 24.8% to 16.0% (Fig 5).

All four habitat types showed a decrease in mean percent stony coral cover between 1996 and 2004 (Fig. 6). Patch reef stations had the highest mean percent stony coral cover. Hardbottom stations had the lowest mean percent stony coral cover; however, those stations have been the most stable between 1996 and 2004.

Decreases in stony coral cover at Upper and Middle Keys sites were less than 0.5%. At Lower Keys sites stony coral cover decreased by 0.8%. The greatest decrease for any region was seen at the Dry Tortugas where stony coral cover decreased from 13.4% in 2003 to 11.7% in 2004 (Fig. 7). Between 2003 and 2004, percent stony coral cover at Dry Tortugas deep reef sites decreased from 18.0% to 16.6%, while cover at patch reefs sites decreased from 4.2% to 1.9%. These decreases offer further evidence of a trend of declining coral cover at Dry Tortugas sites since the CREMP began monitoring efforts there in 1999.
An understanding of the overall trend in stony coral cover can be gained by analyzing the changes in percent cover of the most common species. The six coral species with the greatest mean percent cover Sanctuary-wide in 1996 were *Montastraea annularis*, *Montastraea cavernosa*, *Acropora palmata*, *Siderastrea siderea*, *Millepora complanata*, and *Porites astreoides*. *M. annularis* represented approximately 35% of the stony coral cover at CREMP stations in 1996. *M. annularis* decreased from 4.1% in 1996 to 2.6% in 2004. *M. cavernosa* decreased from 1.4% in 1996 to 1.0% in 2002. Although *Acropora palmata* (elkhorn coral) only occurs in shallow reef habitats comprising 1.1% of the mean stony coral cover in 1996, it is well recognized as a primary framework species. Striking changes were documented for this species. The mean percent cover of *A. palmata* decreased 91% from 1.1% in 1996 to 0.3% in 2004. *Siderastrea siderea* decreased from 1.0% in 1996 to 0.8% in 2004. *Millepora complanata* decreased from 1.0% in 1996 to 0.4% in 2004 while *Porites astreoides* decreased only slightly from 0.6% in 1996 to 0.5% in 2004 (Fig. 8).

Sanctuary-wide, in 2004, the benthic community within CREMP sites was composed of 63% substrate, 13.6% octocoral, 12.7% macroalgae, 6.6% stony coral, 2.0% sponge, 1.8% zooanths, and 0.3% seagrass (Fig. 9). Sanctuary-wide there has been an annual increase in octocoral cover between 2000 and 2004.

Diseases are recorded as either present or absent for each species at a station. Between 1996 and 1999, the number of stations with diseased coral exhibited an increasing trend. However, since 2002 the number of stations with diseased coral has decreased. Stony coral diseases can be sorted into three categories: black band, white diseases (including white plague, white band and white pox), and other (including dark spot, yellow band, and idiopathic diseases). White disease occurred at 90 stations in 2002, but decreased to 54 stations in 2004. While “other” disease has declined from 94 stations in 2002 to 74 stations in 2004. Since 1996 black band disease has occurred at a low number of stations (< 10 stations) with a peak in 1998 (19 stations)(Fig. 10).
Clionid sponge area can be highly variable between locations and years. In the Florida Keys, mean clionid area decreased from 7.0 cm$^2$/m$^2$ in 2001 to 4.3 cm$^2$/m$^2$ in 2002. However, from 2002 to 2004 mean clionid area increased from 4.3 cm$^2$/m$^2$ to 5.1 cm$^2$/m$^2$ (Fig. 11).

Of the four habitat types, the patch reef stations contained the highest mean clionid area. Within the patch reef stations the majority of clionid area occurred in the Lower Keys. Between 2001 and 2004, mean clionid area in the Lower Keys patch reef stations ranged between 21.5 cm$^2$/m$^2$ to 17.5 cm$^2$/m$^2$. The Middle Keys patch reef stations contained the second highest mean clionid area ranging from 4.25 cm$^2$/m$^2$ to 2.9 cm$^2$/m$^2$. The Upper Keys patch reef stations contained the lowest amount of clionid area, less than 0.3 cm$^2$/m$^2$. (Fig. 12).

Of the four regions surveyed, Upper Keys continually had the lowest mean clionid area while the Dry Tortugas had the highest mean area. The Middle and Lower Keys showed similar mean clionid area values. Dry Tortugas, Lower Keys, and Middle Keys all decreased from 2001-2002 (Fig. 14).
The prevalence of disease among all species was 0.4 diseased coral colonies per m\(^2\) or 7.1% of the population in 2002, 0.3 diseased coral colonies per m\(^2\) or 4.0% of the population in 2003, and 0.5 diseased coral colonies per m\(^2\) or 8.2% of the population in 2004 (Fig. 15). Weil, (2004) calculated an average disease prevalence for 28 reefs in the wider Caribbean between 1999 and 2002 to be 5.3% of the population.

Of the coral colonies marked as diseased in 2002 and 2003, 12% of the colonies experienced total mortality by 2004 which represents approximately 1% of the population. While 41% suffered partial mortality, 37% showed no change in live tissue, and 10% had a gain in tissue cover (Fig. 16).

Coral abundance was assessed at 18 VAS. Species richness per site ranged from three at El Radabob to 28 at West Turtle Shoal. Abundance values also varied greatly ranging from 28 colonies at Grecian Rocks to over 400 colonies at West Turtle.

The typical coral community at a CREMP VAS contained 173 colonies representing eleven coral species. Size classes for colonies were 0-10 cm, 10-50 cm and greater than 50 cm. Seventy percent of coral colonies were in the 0-10 cm size class while 24% of colonies were 10-50 cm, and 5% were over 50 cm.

*Sidereastra sidereastra* had the greatest mean number of colonies in the 0-10 cm, and 10-50 cm size classes. Other common corals in the 3-10 cm size class include *M. cavernosa, Stephanocoenia michelini*, and *Millepora alcicornis*. In addition to *Siderastraea sp.*, common corals in the 10-50 cm size class included *S. michelini, Porites astreoides, and M. alcicornis*. The most common coral species over 50 cm include *Montastraea annularis, Copophyllia natans* and *M. cavernosa*.
Stony Coral Species Cover

The six coral species with the greatest mean percent cover in the Dry Tortugas were *Colpophyllia natans*, *Montastraea annularis*, *Montastraea cavernosa*, *Porites astreoides*, *Siderastraea siderea*, and *Porites porites* (Fig. 19).

Dry Tortugas

Stony Coral Cover

Mean stony coral cover for the twelve Dry Tortugas stations was 18.9% in 1999. By 2004, the mean stony coral cover decreased to 11.7%. The largest single year decrease in mean stony coral cover occurred between 2001 (17.4%) and 2002 (14.1%), a decrease of 3.4%. Between 2003 and 2004, stony coral cover at the Dry Tortugas decreased 1.7% from 13.4% to 11.7% (Fig. 17). Both patch and deep reef habitat types in the Dry Tortugas showed a decrease in mean percent stony coral cover between 1999 and 2004. Deep reef stations have consistently had the highest mean percent stony coral cover. Stony coral cover at deep stations decreased from 23.6% in 1999 to 16.6% in 2004 with a 1.4% drop from 2003 to 2004 (Fig. 18). Stony coral cover at patch reef stations decreased from 9.5% in 1999 to 1.9% in 2004 with a 2.3% decrease from 2003 to 2004 (Fig. 18).

Figure 17. Stony coral cover in the Dry Tortugas (1996-2004).

Figure 18. Stony coral cover for two habitat types in the Dry Tortugas (1996-2004).

Figure 19. Stony coral cover for six species with the highest mean percent cover in the Dry Tortugas (1999-2004).
Between 2003 and 2004, mean percent cover decreased for all functional group categories except substrate. Mean percent macroalgae cover decreased from 13.3% in 2003 to 8.4% in 2004. Mean octocoral cover decreased from 12.4% to 9.5% for the same period. Mean percent cover of substrate increased more than 10% from 59.1% in 2003 to 69.2% in 2004 (Fig. 20).

CREMP stations in the Dry Tortugas had consistently higher mean clionid area than stations in the Florida Keys. In the Dry Tortugas, mean clionid area decreased from $12.3 \, \text{cm}^2/\text{m}^2$ in 2001 to $5.9 \, \text{cm}^2/\text{m}^2$ in 2003. In 2004, mean clionid area increased to $9.4 \, \text{cm}^2/\text{m}^2$ (Fig. 21).

At Dry Tortugas CREMP stations, coral disease incidence decreased between 2003 and 2004. Incidence of “White” disease decreased from 12 stations in 2003 to 7 in 2004. Likewise, for the same period, “Other” disease decreased from 10 incidences to six. Black band disease was not observed at the Dry Tortugas stations. Coral bleaching increased slightly from 9 observations in 2003 to 11 in 2004. (Fig. 22).
The significant declines in mean percent stony coral cover between 1997 and 1999 were largely due to losses in *M. annularis*, *A. palmata*, and *M. complanata*. The large decline in mean stony coral cover was evident in all three regions in the Florida Keys (Lower, Middle, and Upper Keys), as well as three habitat types (offshore deep, offshore shallow, and patch reef stations). While no significant changes were reported on a Sanctuary-wide level between 1999 and 2003, dramatic changes are still occurring. Between 2003 and 2004, stony coral cover declined from 7.2% to 6.6%. The difference in stony coral cover between individual years is not statistically significant; however, preliminary analysis indicates that the cumulative difference in stony coral cover between 2000 and 2004 is statistically significant (p=0.12). The Sanctuary-wide decrease in stony coral cover is reflected regionally in data from the Lower Keys patch reef sites where stony coral cover decreased by 1.5% between 2003 and 2004. This decrease was primarily due to a continued loss in cover of *Montastraea annularis* which declined from 11.0% in 1997 to 4.5% in 2004.

The decrease in stony coral cover observed at the Dry Tortugas between 2003 and 2004 occurred at both deep and patch reef sites. Although it is probable that some loss of stony coral cover occurred at shallow patch reef sites as the result of Hurricane Charley, the losses at Black Coral Rock were observed prior to the storm. The loss documented by the CREMP between 2003 and 2004 is not the result of declines in percent cover of any one species, but rather the result of small incremental decreases in cover of ten different stony coral species. Stony corals were not the only functional group for which the CREMP documented a decline in 2004. Every functional group category at Dry Tortugas sites, except substrate, decreased in mean percent cover for the period 2003-2004. The decreases in percent cover of macroalgae, sponge and octocoral were likely due to the effects of Hurricane Charley as evidenced by numbers of detached organisms observed on certain areas of the reef.

The continued decline of stony coral cover at the Dry Tortugas sites is alarming. The CREMP has recorded a decline in stony coral cover at the Dry Tortugas every year since sampling began in 1999. Although the Dry Tortugas sites still have greater species diversity and greater stony coral cover than the Keys, Dry Tortugas reefs appear to be declining at a greater rate than the Keys. The recent addition of monitoring sites in the Dry Tortugas National Park may help define the causes of the decline.

CREMP data shows a continued loss of stony coral species richness in the FKNMS. Since 2002, mean number of stony coral species per site has decreased at patch reef, shallow reef and deep reef habitats while hardbottom habitats showed an increase in mean number of species per site. Between 1996 and 1999, the number of stations with diseased coral exhibited an increasing trend. However, since 2002 the number of stations with diseased coral has decreased. CREMP data indicates that at the 18 VAS stations, only 12% of the coral colonies marked as diseased in 2002 and 2003 experienced total mortality by 2004. 88% of the coral colonies marked as diseased in 2002 and 2003 only experienced partial tissue loss, no change in tissue, or an increase in tissue. In addition, Torres (2004) calculated the net coral tissue loss caused by disease to be only 0.4m$^2$ between 2002 and 2003. This data indicates that coral diseases are not having a major impact on the declines of percent coral cover seen at CREMP sites (Torres, 2004).

Results from the bio-eroding sponge survey show distinct trends between habitat types as well as between regions. Monitoring stations in the Upper Keys have much lower clionid area than the stations in the Middle or Lower Keys. Within the habitats, the patch reef stations generally contain the highest mean clionid area. Clionid area also exhibits a distinct pattern within the regions patch reef stations. The Lower Keys patch reefs contain the majority of clionid area compared to the Middle and Upper Keys. The difference can possibly be attributed to levels of nutrients in waters surrounding Lower Keys patch reefs (Callahan, 2005).
Coral reefs in Florida and the wider Caribbean face a number of stressors including coral bleaching, disease, water pollution, physical impacts (such as groundings), and others. Reef related tourism is responsible for considerable economic benefits to coastal communities, but the associated increase in population and demand on resources often increases stress on the reefs through increased sedimentation, nutrient pollution, and over-use of reef resources. Water quality has markedly deteriorated in the Keys over the last 30 years. Changes of water flow patterns in Florida Bay (due to the causeways connecting the islands to the mainland), increases in sedimentation (from recreational boat traffic, dredging, historical infilling, and wetland removal), and of nearshore nutrient concentrations (from local wastewaters, and fertilizers from the agricultural fields of southern Florida), plus industrial pollutants from Miami, have probably all contributed to the decline in water quality (Lang et al., 1998). Although recent analysis of water quality data for the waters of the Florida Keys and Florida Bay has defined several sources of pollution (Wilkinson et al, 2004), much work remains to be done to stem the flow of pollutants to the reefs. Florida’s reefs are still affected by run-off from the Everglades via Florida Bay and from the Keys themselves (Boyer and Jones, 2002).

Currently efforts are underway to address water quality issues at the local and regional level. The National Pollution Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) is a federal program designed to eliminate point source and storm water discharges to receiving waters. Mandated in the federal Clean Water Act, the NPDES permit program controls water pollution by regulating point sources that discharge pollutants into waters of the State. The program has been effective in requiring many private small wastewater package plants to eliminate raw sewage discharges (Andrews et al, 2004).

Additional efforts are being made to respond to specific stressors facing Florida’s coral reefs. The scientists and managers from FKNMS, Mote Marine Laboratory, FWRI, FDEP, University of Miami and others recently held a workshop to develop a mass coral bleaching impact assessment protocol that will permit an effective and coordinated response by research and management officials in case of a mass bleaching event in the sanctuary. Additionally, scientists and managers from FWRI, FDEP, The National Coral Reef Institute and FKNMS have joined forces with The Nature Conservancy and the Great Barrier Reef Marine Park Authority in the Florida Reef Resilience Program. The program has the long-term goals of identifying specific high and low risk reef areas and defining localized vs. regional/global influences on reef community structure.

In response to continued declines in the condition of coral reef ecosystems world-wide, the US Coral Reef Task Force, Global Coral Reef Monitoring Network, Pew Commission on Ocean Policy, and the International Coral Reef Initiative have all called for increased coral reef monitoring. The data reported herein documents similar declines in species richness and stony coral cover in the Florida Keys and Dry Tortugas. Protection of this valuable cultural, economic and ecological resource will require wise management decisions supported by the best available information on the status and trends of the resource. This information can only be provided by a spatially expansive, statistically rigorous, scientific monitoring program such as the CREMP.
Literature Cited


This project is funded by the US Environmental Protection Agency and the NOAA Coastal Ocean Program for the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary.